THE ROLE OF THE RISK MANAGER IN THE INVESTMENT MANAGEMENT INDUSTRY





Ms. Hilary Till Premia Risk Consultancy, Inc. Chicago, IL

November 13, 2003



PRESENTATION OUTLINE

Examples from:

- I. Boston-based Mutual Fund Company
- **II. Boutique Commodity Futures Trading Firm**
- **III.** Chicago-based Fixed Income Company



PRESENTATION OUTLINE

(Continued)

IV. Future Challenges



I. Boston-based Mutual Fund Company (1995 – 1998)

The Role of the Risk Manager:

- A. First Phase
- **B.** Second Phase
- C. Summary



A. First Phase

- Motivation: Avoid derivatives problems.
- The idea of an independent risk manager was a new concept for the buy-side.
- The challenge at the time was to figure out how to adapt the sell-side approach to risk management to the buy side.



- 1. Staffing
- One independent Financial Risk Manager reporting into the Corporate Treasury, who in turn, reported to the Chief Financial Officer.



2. Buy-Side Definition of Risk started with the Prudent Man Rule:

"All that can be required of a trustee to invest, is, that he shall conduct himself faithfully and exercise a sound discretion. *He is to observe how men of prudence, discretion, and intelligence manage their own affairs*"

- Justice Samuel Putnam, 1830.



- 2. Buy-Side Definition of Risk (Continued)
- Risk was not to be measured in absolute terms but instead, relative to a peer group ...
- ... with an index sometimes proxying for the peer group.
- Thus the concept of tracking error, as the primary risk measure, was born.



- 3. Franchise Risk
- The Risk Manager chaired monthly Risk Management Committee meetings,
 - which included investment, accounting, legal, and operations officials;
 - the key goal was to deliberate on any matter that might represent franchise risk to the firm;
 - the discussions were largely qualitative in nature; and
 - included reviewing derivatives activity across the firm.



- 3. Franchise Risk (Continued)
- The risk manager also became responsible for:
 - reviewing all new products at the firm, and
 - creating a formal process for the review of new products.



- Motivation: Eventually enter into the alternative investment product arena ...
- ... and therefore upgrade staff and systems in the area of independent risk management.



- 1. Additional Staffing
- Equity Risk Manager, Fixed Income Risk Manager, and a Counterparty Credit Risk Manager.



- 2. Systems
- Year-long effort to identify an appropriate riskmanagement system for measuring and monitoring risk relative to benchmarks.





- 2. Systems (Continued)
- Detailed discussions and negotiations with top vendors like Riskmetrics, BARRA, and Goldman Sachs.
- **3.** Reviews of Sensitive Operational Risk Issues



C. Summary

Qualitative and Process Oriented

- Initially the role of the risk manager was largely qualitative and process oriented ...
- ... with an emphasis on gaining resource commitments.

Quantitative

• Later the role became much more quantitative.



II. Boutique Commodity Futures Trading Firm (1998 to the Present)

- Motivation: Have risk management designed into the investment process.
- A. Risk management may be the most important element of an investment process.
- **B.** Risk management policies are a product design issue.
- C. Risk management policies determine whether a program will be viable.



II. Boutique Commodity Futures Firm (Continued)

- **D.** Standard risk management methodology from traditional asset managers is a useful starting point.
- E. Risk management rules flow from an understanding of price behavior.
- F. Useful risk management reports in futures trading.
- G. Summary



A. Risk Management and the Investment Process

- The key to a successful investment program is not in finding strategies that have a statistical edge.
- A prominent hedge fund manager with currently over \$4 billion under management told me in 1993:

"Other people have the same information as I do; other people put on the same trades on as I do. I make money; they don't."



B. Risk Management Policies are a Product Design Issue

- In derivatives trading, an investment manager has a lot of flexibility in designing an investment program.
- Futures trading requires a relatively small amount of margin.



• For example, some programs only require \$7 for each \$100 of exposure.



B. Risk Management Policies are a Product Design Issue (Continued)

- The result is that a futures trader can easily adjust their leverage level to magnify gains (and losses.)
- Trade sizing is a matter of determining how much risk one wants to assume.
- A trader is not very constrained by the amount of initial capital committed to trading.



B. Risk Management Policies are a Product Design Issue

(Continued)

Delevered Returns by Strategy

1997-2001 Analysis

Style	Average Levered Return (%)*	Average Delevered Return (%)*	Historical Financial Leverage*
Short Biased	13.7	9.3	0.3
Global Macro	16.8	8.9	2.0
Emerging Markets	16.9	8.8	1.0
Event Driven	14.7	8.3	1.1
Merger Arbitrage	14.7	7.0	1.8
Long/Short Equity	14.0	6.3	1.3
Fixed Income	9.6	4.8	1.5
Convertible Arbitrage	10.6	4.2	2.6
Managed Futures	10.5	4.2	2.8
Distressed Securities	n/a	n/a	1.2



* Leverage analysis was done for funds with 5 year Historical Leverage and performance data Source: Altvest, CSFB/Tremont, EACM, HFR, Tuna, Institutional Investor (June 2002), CMRA Analysis



B. Risk Management Policies are a Product Design Issue (Continued)

 With the ability to leverage, one must ensure that investors can tolerate the potential withinperiod losses.



Source: Kritzman, Mark, "Hidden Risks of Hedge Funds, and Asset Allocation versus Security Selection," Presentation to QWAFAFEW, 2/12/02.



<u>C. Risk Management Policies Determine Whether a</u> <u>Program will be Viable</u>

Our belief is that a number of statistically significant investment opportunities exist because of the possibility of very large losses.





D. Standard Risk Management Methodology is a Useful <u>Starting Point</u>

- The conventional asset manager approach is a useful first step.
- One still needs to add several layers to this approach because of:
 - the unique statistical properties of commodity futures contracts, and
 - the different way futures products are marketed.



- Diversified portfolios of equities have returns that appear to be symmetrically distributed.
- It is a different matter for commodity prices.



- The empirical behavior of commodity prices can be described as follows:
 - Commodity prices are *extremely* volatile;
 - There exist rare but violent explosions in prices; and
 - There is substantial positive skewness in the price distributions.



(Continued)

Value-at-Risk

The portfolio's volatility is calculated using the recent volatilities and correlations of the portfolio's instruments.





Value-at-Risk (Continued)

- The standard Value-at-Risk approach alone is inadequate for a commodity portfolio.
- A commodity portfolio consists of instruments that have a tendency toward extreme positive skewness in returns.
- This measure, though, is still useful when it is twinned with other measures.



Scenario Testing

- Using long-term data, an investor can directly examine the worst performance of a commodity trade under similar circumstances.
- This measure will sometimes be larger than the Valueat-Risk measure based on recent volatility.



Diversification and Concentration Risk

Example of Portfolio Effect When Combining Independent Strategies





Understanding the Fundamental Drivers of a Strategy

 The following graphs illustrate how two normally unrelated markets can become temporarily very related:





(Continued)

<u>Understanding the Fundamental Drivers of a Strategy</u> (Continued)





<u>Understanding the Fundamental Drivers of a Strategy</u> (Continued)

- In July, both corn and natural gas prices are heavily dependent on the outcome of weather in the U.S. Midwest.
- And in July 1999, the Midwest experienced blistering temperatures.



Extraordinary Stress Testing

- Futures products are marketed as equity diversifiers.
- Therefore, one job of risk management is to attempt to ensure that a futures investment will not be correlated to stocks during dramatic equity declines.
- For a futures portfolio, it is prudent to examine how the portfolio would have performed during various well-defined stock market declines.







F. Useful Risk Management Reports in Futures Trading

- On a per-strategy basis, it is useful to examine each strategy's:
 - Value-at-Risk based on recent volatilities and correlations;
 - Worst-case loss during normal times;
 - Worst-case loss during well-defined eventful periods;




- Incremental contribution to Portfolio Value-at-Risk; and
- Incremental contribution to Worst-Case Portfolio Event Risk.
- The latter two measures give indications on whether the strategy is a risk reducer or risk enhancer.



- On a portfolio-wide basis, it is useful to examine:
 - Value-at-Risk based on recent volatilities and correlations;
 - Worst-case loss during normal times; and
 - Worst-case loss during eventful periods.



- The next two slides give examples of a futures portfolio with the recommended measures displayed.
- Note the properties of the soybean crush spread.
- It is a portfolio event-risk reducer, but it also adds to the volatility of the portfolio.



Commodity Risk Reports

		Worst-Case Loss	Worst-Case Loss
Strategy	Value-At-Risk	During Normal Times	During Eventful Period
Deferred Reverse Soybean Crush Spread	2.78%	-1.09%	-1.42%
Long Deferred Natural Gas Outright	0.66%	-0.18%	-0.39%
Short Deferred Wheat Spread	0.56%	-0.80%	-0.19%
Long Deferred Gasoline Outright	2.16%	-0.94%	-0.95%
Long Deferred Gasoline vs. Heating Oil Spread	2.15%	-1.04%	-2.22%
Long Deferred Hog Spread	0.90%	-1.21%	-0.65%
Portfolio	3.01%	-2.05%	-2.90%



Commodity Risk Reports (Continued)

	Incremental Contribution to	Incremental Contribution to
Strategy	Portfolio Value-At-Risk*	Worst-Case Portfolio Event Risk*
Deferred Reverse Soybean Crush Spread	0.08%	-0.24%
Long Deferred Natural Gas Outright	0.17%	0.19%
Short Deferred Wheat Spread	0.04%	0.02%
Long Deferred Gasoline Outright	0.33%	0.81%
Long Deferred Gasoline vs. Heating Oil Spread	0.93%	2.04%
Long Deferred Hog Spread	0.07%	-0.19%

* A positive contribution means that the strategy adds to risk while a negative contributions means the strategy reduces risk.



• So an incremental contribution to risk measure based solely on recent volatilities and correlations does not give complete information about whether a trade is a diversifier or not.



- Another example concerns financial futures trades.
- This example portfolio consists of a long Russell 2000 vs. a short S&P 500 futures trade and a long Municipal Bond vs. a short U.S. Bond futures trade.
- These trades are normally unrelated as illustrated in the graphs on the next slide ...







• But during a scenario test of the portfolio's sensitivity to event risk, we find that the combination of the two trades results in an exposure to a liquidity shock.



•	Event	<u> Maximum Loss</u>	
	October 1987 stock market crash	-4.11%	
	Gulf War in 1990	-4.12%	
	Fall 1998 bond market debacle	-6.42%	
	Aftermath of 9/11 attacks	-3.95%	



<u>Worst-Case Event</u>
Fall 1998 bond market debacle

Maximum Loss -6.42%

• <u>Value-at-Risk based on recent volatilities and</u> <u>correlations</u>

3.67%



- The short legs of each spread are the more liquid of the pair.
- So both of these trades are at risk to a flight-to-quality event as happened during the Fall of 1998.
- One response to a concentrated risk to a liquidity shock has been to purchase OTM fixed-income calls.



G. Summary

Quantitative

- Here the role of the risk manager has been largely quantitative ...
- ... with an emphasis on combining classic risk management techniques with domain-specific knowledge.



III. Chicago-based Fixed Income Company (2003)

- *Motivation: Create a plan for using over-the-counter derivatives in fixed-income funds.*
- A. Incorporate derivatives into the investment process.
- **B.** Adopt "Risk Standards for Institutional Managers and Institutional Investors."
- C. Summary



A. Incorporate Derivatives into the Investment Process

- "Define the investment process in terms of risk management.
- Establish clear investment objectives and acceptable risk tolerance level.
- Create a set of boundary conditions for the level of risk and the cost of risk reduction."

Source: Collins, Bruce, and Frank Fabozzi, "Derivatives and Risk Management," *Journal of Portfolio Management*, May 1999, p. 23.



A. Incorporate Derivatives into the Investment Process (Continued)

- "Assess the full range of possible outcomes of using derivatives and the respective costs.
- Assess the impact of using derivatives on the risk profile of the portfolio.
- Establish a monitoring protocol to measure risk.
- Develop an adjustment response mechanism."

Source: Collins, Bruce, and Frank Fabozzi, "Derivatives and Risk Management," *Journal of Portfolio Management*, May 1999, p. 23.



B. Adopt "Risk Standards"



• This pie chart summarizes the framework noted in the 1996 report, "Risk Standards for Institutional Managers and Institutional Investors."



C. Summary

Conceptual Framework

• The issues are largely process oriented and involve a consultant recommending the creation of two new positions: a derivatives overlay manager and an independent risk manager.



IV. Future Challenges

- Motivation: The underlying framework for the investment management industry may need revamping.
- A. Current Framework: Policy Portfolios and Relative Risk
- B. Post-Bubble View: Absolute Returns From Each Investment
- C. Summary



A. Current Framework

- 1. Industry Organization
- 2. Investment Process
- 3. Risk Measurement and Monitoring
- 4. Consequences



1. Industry Organization

• Pension fund consultants and financial planners advise on the long-term asset allocation mix or policy portfolio.

		Minimum	POLICY	Maximum	Benchmark
1. 2. 3. 4. 5.	Domestic equities Foreign equities Emerging markets Private equities Total Equities: Absolute return portfolio	12% 10 3 <u>10</u> 40 0	22% 15 9 <u>15</u> 61 3	40 % 20 13 <u>20</u> 75 10	80% S&P500, 10% S&P 400, 10% Russell 2000 93% EAFE, 7% Salomon Extended ex USMS IFC Global and EMBI+ Cambridge Associates Weighted Composite 60% Sal Global Eq, 20% Morgan Global Bonds, 20% LIBOR + 5% Salomon High Viold and Pankrupt
7. 8.	Commodity-related ^a Real estate Total	3 4 12	6 <u>7</u> 21	9 <u>10</u> 32	GSCI and NCREIF Timber leverage adjusted NCREIF Property Index, 50% leverage
9. 10. 11. 12.	Domestic bonds Foreign bonds Inflation-indexed bonds Cash Total Fixed Income:	5 0 2 <u>(8)</u> 8 Overall Total:	10 4 7 <u>(3)</u> <u>18</u> 100%	20 10 12 <u>10</u> 30	Lehman 6+ year Treasury Index J.P. Morgan Non U.S. Salomon 5+ year TIPS One month LIBOR

Current Policy Portfolio (October 2000)



<u>1. Industry Organization</u> (Continued)

- Each asset class within the mix is assigned a benchmark.
- The investment managers are responsible for providing investment results that are relative to the benchmark.
- The investor owns the risk of the benchmark.



2. Investment Process

- The investment process is centered around ensuring that any deviation from the benchmark is an active investment decision.
- The scaling of each active bet should correspond to the degree of confidence in that bet.

Source: Kuenzi, David, "Strategy Benchmarks From the Investment Manager's Perspective," *Journal of Portfolio Management*, Winter 2003, Exhibit 1.





3. Risk Measurement and Monitoring

• The risks that are monitored are all *relative* risks:

- Style Drift

- Tracking Error



4. Consequences

- A mutual fund can lose over 50% of its market value.
- This is acceptable as long as the losses are consistent with its benchmark or product category.
- In 2001, this was the case for the aggressive growth equity style.



4. Consequences (Continued)

- The manager can note that the performance is consistent with its product design.
- The manager can also note that they will continue offering the product.
- Articles on the topic are broadly sympathetic to the manager.



B. Post-Bubble View

- 1. Throw Out Equity Benchmarks
- 2. Policy Portfolios are Obsolete
- 3. Downside Risk Protection Becomes Crucial
- 4. Consequences
- 5. Risk Management



<u>1. Throw Out Equity Benchmarks</u>

- Equity benchmarks produce a high tracking error against underlying liabilities of pension plans.
- Alan Brown, group Chief Investment Officer of State Street Global Advisors
- Instead, pension plans may start considering:
 - Bigger allocations to bonds;
 - Increased use of risk budgeting; and
 - Allocations to absolutereturn products.



BENCHMARKS

TIME TO THROW OUT EQUITY BENCHMARKS

A move away from relying on equity benchmarks could herald a new era in asset management.

Source: Global Investor, November 2002.

2. Policy Portfolios are Obsolete

- "The present structure has a lot of conveniences: it's a very easy way to organize the way we go about doing business.
- It sets up clear-cut marching orders for consultants and other people to tell us to do particular jobs.
- All of that suggests a degree of neatness about the investment process (but) there is nothing neat about it. It's very hard."

Source: Peter Bernstein, quoted in, Chernoff, Joel, "Radical Thought: Bernstein Suggests Policy Portfolios No Longer Make Good Sense," *Pensions & Investments*, March 17, 2003.



3. Downside Risk Protection Becomes Crucial

- Once one no longer has faith in equity benchmarks providing target returns, ...
- ... downside risk management becomes crucial.



3. Downside Risk Protection is Crucial (Continued)

- "Investors are not indifferent whether an active manager simply captures the premium of the asset class"
- " or whether he or she tilts the return distribution of the portfolio to the right."

Source: Ineichen, Alexander, "Asymmetric Returns and Sector Specialists," *Journal of Alternative Investments*, Spring 2003, pp. 31-40.



4. Consequences

- A manager is expected to keep losses under control.
- It is unacceptable for a manager to lose more than 50% of market value.



5. Risk Management

- Event Risk
- Extreme Risk





C. Summary

- Economic historian, Peter Bernstein, calls for investors to assemble portfolios that naturally hedge investors against conceivable extreme outcomes.
- This may become a new framework around which investment management is organized.



C. Summary (Continued)

- The role of the risk manager at investment management firms will therefore need to evolve in a world where ...
- ... policy portfolios, benchmarks, and relative risk measures may become less crucial to investment management.



Source of Graphics (not directly credited in presentation)

- Slide 1, Statue of Ceres, ancient Roman goddess of the harvest, Chicago Board of Trade.
- Slide 13, excerpt from Barber, Joel, "Active Portfolio Management," Slide 15, Department of Finance, BA 205A, Florida International University.
- Slide 19, sample Refco futures statement, 11/20/01.
- Slide 21, excerpt from presentation by Leslie Rahl of CMRA, "Hedge Fund Transparency: Unravelling the Complex and Controversial Debate," Slide 52, RiskInvest 2002, Boston, 12/10/02.


Source of Graphics (Continued)

- Slide 23, cover of <u>Against the Gods: The Remarkable Story of Risk</u> by Peter Bernstein, John Wiley & Sons, Inc., 1996.
- Slide 27, graph of historical Value-at-Risk for a commodity portfolio from "The Energy Market" presentation by Global Advisors Limited, Slide 22.
- Slide 30, graph of portfolio volatility vs. number of strategies from Till, Hilary, "Passive Strategies in the Commodity Futures Markets." *Derivatives Quarterly*, Fall 2000, p 54.
- Slides 31 and 32, graphs of Natural Gas vs. Corn prices from Till, Hilary, "Taking Full Advantage of the Statistical Properties of Commodity Investments." *The Journal of Alternative Investments*, Summer 2001, p. 65.



Source of Graphics (Continued)

- Slide 35, excerpt from presentation by Richard Horwitz of Kenmar, "Constructing a 'Risk-Efficient' Portfolio of Hedge Funds," Slide 26, RiskInvest 2002, Boston, 12/11/02.
- Slide 36, Degas, Edgar, "The Cotton Exchange at New Orleans," 1873, Musée Municipal, Pau, France.
- Slides 40 and 41, commodity portfolio risk measures from Till, Hilary, "Risk Management Lessons in Leveraged Futures Trading," *Commodities Now*, September 2002, pp. 84-87.



Source of Graphics (Continued)

- Slide 44, graphs of RLX-SPX vs. MOB futures spreads, The Bloomberg.
- Slide 53, excerpt from presentation by Leslie Rahl of CMRA, "Hedge Fund Transparency: Unravelling the Complex and Controversial Debate," Slide 7, RiskInvest 2002, Boston, 12/10/02.
- Slide 57, "Harvard Management Company (2001)," Harvard Business School Case Study, 9-201-129, 10/23/2001, Exhibit 4.
- Slide 69, cover of <u>Fooled By Randomness: The Hidden Role of Chance in the</u> <u>Markets and Life</u> by Nassim Nicholas Taleb, Texere LLC, 2001.

CONTACT US



Ms. Hilary Till <u>Premia Risk Consultancy, Inc.</u>

Phone:312-583-1137Fax:312-873-3914

E-mail: info@premiacap.com

